|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | **Walailak Journal of Science and Technology** |

***Responses the referee’s comments***

**Manuscript ID:**  11233

**Title:** Automatic Thai Finger Spelling Transcription.

**Reviewer A**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **No.** | **Referee’s Comments** | **Responses**  (for author) |
|  | How signing and non-signing frames are separated. Is there is any technique for the separation. |  |
|  | More explanation required for Fig.1, Fig 2. | The Figure 1 and Figure 2 have been added more description. |
|  | It would be better if the author shows how the proposed approach is better than the approaches in the literature. | For our situation, our work focuses on a TFS sign sequence image. A previous work of TFS has not been addressed.  For example AFS have addressed with classification approach and use accuracy as a evaluate matrix but our system uses word error rate as a evaluate matric. |
|  | As WFS smoothening mechanism improves the performance of ATFS. Is author tested any other smoothening mechanisms that are suited to improve the performance of ATFS before comes to the conclusion of using WFS smoothening. |  |
|  | Conclusions should be more precise. |  |

**Reviewer B**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **No.** | **Referee’s Comments** | **Responses**  (for author) |
|  | Need to support statements with references. E.g. “. Each country creates its own sign language with its own grammar and lexicon”, “Various schemes have been employed for finger spelling …”. |  |
|  | The title of this section is recommended to be changed to “Literature Review” | We have changed a sentence in line….. |
|  | Starting a sentence with a reference is not recommended as in: “[1] has addressed FSR for …”, “[2] has employed a Yolo-based Darknet-19”, etc. |  |
|  | Figure 4 “CNN structure of SR stage”: never mentioned activation layer! as it is an important operation in a typical CNN. Please explain. | The mor detail caption has been added to Figure 4. |
|  | Authors spoke about frame smoothing bunt never shown example images to demonstrate the effects of this technique. | Thank you for your suggestion. The CNN would be improve a performance in the future work. This work we follows the CNN structure from [1]. It provide a good performance for extraction the sign image feature. Another reason we would like to know the performance of overall system if t |
|  | Typical performance results of CNN models produce very competitive/impressive accuracy. The results of the proposed approach are not up to that expectation. It is advised that the authors address this issue and hopefully justify their results. |  |

**Reviewer C**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **No.** | **Referee’s Comments** | **Responses**  (for author) |
|  | please add the novelty of this research to the introduction |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |